

Bond University
Research Repository



Underlying Knowledge of Construction Management Consultants in China

Hu, Xin; Xia, Bo; Ye, Kunhui; Skitmore, Martin

Published in:
Journal of Professional Issues in Engineering Education and Practice

DOI:
[10.1061/\(ASCE\)EI.1943-5541.0000263](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)EI.1943-5541.0000263)

Licence:
Other

[Link to output in Bond University research repository.](#)

Recommended citation(APA):
Hu, X., Xia, B., Ye, K., & Skitmore, M. (2016). Underlying Knowledge of Construction Management Consultants in China. *Journal of Professional Issues in Engineering Education and Practice*, 142(2), [04015015].
[https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)EI.1943-5541.0000263](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)EI.1943-5541.0000263)

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

For more information, or if you believe that this document breaches copyright, please contact the Bond University research repository coordinator.

Underlying Knowledge of Construction Management Consultants in China

Xin Hu¹, Bo Xia², Kunhui Ye³, and Martin Skitmore⁴

ABSTRACT

To meet clients/owners' multidimensional and changing requirements, construction management consultants (CMCs) ought to possess a diverse and dynamic knowledge structure. In China, although the population of CMCs has grown to the point of their being indispensable in the industry, their knowledge structure has not been explored explicitly. The study presented in this paper investigated this by first conducting a comprehensive content analysis of the curricula of the highest ranked construction management university courses in China. This was followed by in-depth interviews with experts, resulting in the identification of 22 main knowledge areas that can be grouped into technology, economy, management and law. A questionnaire survey was then conducted among 115 experienced CMCs to evaluate the current level of knowledge in these areas together with their importance and need-for-improvement. The main findings demonstrate the significance of the identified 22 knowledge areas, and they also need substantial improvement in practice. The research has practical implications for China's CMCs to develop necessary knowledge and the extent to

¹ Xin Hu - Visiting research student, Research Center of Construction Economics and Management, Chongqing University, 83# Shabei Street, Shapingba District, Chongqing, China, 400045.
Ph.D. Student, School of Civil Engineering and Built Environment, Queensland University of Technology, Garden Point Campus, 2 George Street, Brisbane QLD 4001, Email: huxincqu@gmail.com

² Bo Xia – Ph.D., Senior Lecturer, School of Civil Engineering and Built Environment, Queensland University of Technology, Garden Point Campus, 2 George Street, Brisbane QLD 4001, Email: paul.xia@qut.edu.au

³ Kunhui Ye – Ph.D., Professor, International Research Center for Sustainable Built Environment, Chongqing University, Chongqing, China, 83# Shabei Street, Shapingba District, Chongqing, China, 400045.
Email: Kunhui.YE@Gmail.com; (corresponding author).

⁴ Martin Skitmore – Ph.D., Professor, School of Civil Engineering and Built Environment, Queensland University of Technology, Garden Point Campus, 2 George Street, Brisbane QLD 4001, Australia.
Email: rm.skitmore@qut.edu.au

19 which they need to be improved to provide a better quality of services in future.

20

21 **KEYWORDS**

22

23 Construction professional services, construction management consultants, knowledge
24 structure, education, training, China

25

26 **INTRODUCTION**

27

28 The size of the construction industry in China has expanded rapidly in recent years. As an
29 emerging business sector, construction management services (CMSs) offer professional
30 services to clients/owners or on their behalf in managing the construction process. In addition
31 to well-recognized services such as construction supervision, project bidding and quantity
32 surveying, CMSs in general embrace all other consulting activities that are related to
33 construction management with the intention of achieving predefined project goals (Shi et al.
34 2014). These activities create value through successful generation and management of
35 knowledge and relatively intensive inputs of technology and human capital (Styles et al 2005).
36 The value creation of CMS matches the attributes of knowledge-intensive business services,
37 thus CMS has been appreciated knowledge-intensive (Lu and Sexton 2007; Jewell et al
38 2014).

39

40 According to the National Bureau of Statistics of China (2006-2013), the construction
41 industry had experienced a 21.7 percent average annual growth over the period 2005-2012,
42 with an output that had reached 13721.8 billion Yuan by 2012. The rapid growth of the
43 construction industry has yielded a tremendous CMS market potential. For instance, the

44 revenue for construction supervision alone had an annual increase of 15.06 percent,
45 amounting to 171.73 billion Yuan in 2012 (Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural
46 Development 2012). CMS prosperity in the Chinese construction industry attracts an
47 increasing number of both domestic and international construction management consultants
48 (CMCs) to run business in the country - significantly intensifying the market competition
49 (Zhao et al. 2011).

50

51 To erect competitive advantages, it is necessary for CMCs to improve competence through
52 knowledge acquisition (Ahadzie et al. 2008; Hwang and Ng 2013). First, clients/owners'
53 demands for CMSs are unique, novel, and transient (Chinyio et al. 1998; Turner and Müller
54 2003; Lindahl and Ryd 2007). CMCs' knowledge should enable them to provide
55 clients/owners with quality services for to-be-built projects and to satisfy stakeholders'
56 requirements effectively (Cheng et al. 2005). Second, it is CMCs' responsibility to resolve
57 unanticipated problems on construction sites (e.g., quality, delay, cost overrun) and to realize
58 project goals as expected by using multiple-disciplinary knowledge (Prahalad and Hamel
59 1990; Ajmal et al. 2010; Liu 2012). Third, social concern over sustainable development calls
60 for advancing traditional construction management goals - quality, cost and time with green
61 construction practices (Hill and Bowen 1997; Du Plessis 2007). To this end, CMCs need to
62 broaden knowledge to ensure that they are able to overcome sustainability challenges in the
63 construction process (Hwang and Ng 2013). Lastly, recent years have witnessed the
64 increasing complexity of construction projects in terms of building structure, function, and
65 construction technology and process (Xia and Chan 2012). Knowledge advancement is
66 needed to facilitate CMCs to improve service customization along with the development of
67 construction projects.

68

69 While it has been recognized that CMCs have the importance of accumulating knowledge to
70 improve core competence, there lacks academic efforts contributed to exploring the
71 need-for-improvement of knowledge in practice (Edum-Fotwe and McCaffer 2000; Blayse
72 and Manley 2004; Nitithamyong and Skibniewski 2004; Hwang and Ng 2013). Additionally,
73 previous studies on CMCs' knowledge are more concerned with a general image of
74 construction practices than the uniqueness of geographical construction markets (Russell et al.
75 1997; Odusami 2002; Dogbegah et al. 2011). Given the proliferation and heterogeneity of
76 CMSs in China, understanding the knowledge structure of CMCs is of importance and hence
77 the motivation for this study.

78

79 In this study, construction management curricula adopted by Chinese universities that offer
80 construction management programs were first examined to reveal the knowledge areas that
81 CMCs are expected to have. These knowledge areas were refined through interviewing some
82 experts. A questionnaire survey was then conducted to measure both the importance and the
83 need-for-improvement of the proposed knowledge areas. Knowledge is indispensable to
84 CMCs' skill set and has become integral to organizational competitiveness (Edum-Fotwe and
85 McCaffer 2000; El-Sabaa 2001; Ogunlana et al. 2002; Nitithamyong and Tan 2007; Hwang
86 and Ng 2013). It is thus envisaged that the research findings help China's CMCs understand
87 their knowledge requirements and hence lead to their improved competitiveness.

88

89 **LITERATURE REVIEW**

90

91 The professional services that CMCs provide to clients/owners are knowledge-intensive
92 activities (Miles 2005; NACE 2008). CMS involves architectural and engineering, technical
93 consultancy (Muller and Doloreux 2009), non-engineering, and management planning (Ceran

94 and Dorman 1995; Russell et al. 1997; Edum-Fotwe and McCaffer 2000). The outspread
95 CMS activities imply that CMCs' knowledge is determined by products, processes and
96 people in the construction industry (Robinson et al. 2005).

97

98 Although clients/owners have dissimilar service demands, the fundamental functions of
99 construction management that CMCs perform are similar, normally including integration,
100 scope, time, cost, quality, human resource, communication, risk and procurement (Liu et al.
101 2004). Nevertheless, to what extent CMCs have to acquire knowledge depends on the tasks
102 they have been assigned and potential construction problems they are to encounter (Woo et al.
103 2004). CMCs are assigned duties and they need to deal with the assignment through schedule
104 planning, stakeholder management, cost engineering, human resources management,
105 financing, information technology utilization, contract management, and communication
106 (Edum-Fotwe and McCaffer 2000). It seems therefore to be that CMCs' knowledge should
107 contain construction technology, cost saving techniques, labor management, programmer for
108 delivering, quality management, site layout techniques for monitoring, materials management
109 system, health and safety, risk management measures and environment impact assessment
110 (Ahadzie et al. 2008).

111

112 CMCs' knowledge areas have been outlined by some project management institutes as well
113 as in the body of knowledge of construction management (Cleland 1995; Wirth and Tryloff
114 1995). According to the Project Management Institute (PMI), the body of project
115 management knowledge has nine areas, namely integration management, scope management,
116 time management, quality management, human resources management, communication
117 management, risk management, procurement management and stakeholder management
118 (PMBOK 2013). Each area involves a set of inputs, outputs, tools and techniques within the

119 project management process (PMBOK 2013). In the fifth edition of the Association for
120 Project Management's (APM) Body of Knowledge, introductions and common guides are
121 given to address the knowledge areas essential to manage projects, programs and portfolios
122 (Association for Project Management 2006). They are not a set of rules that must be followed
123 but should be fully known by CMCs to guarantee successful project delivery. The knowledge
124 areas indicated by these two institutes mirror widely recognized good practices, but they
125 deserve development in a specific construction context.

126

127 CMCs' knowledge structure can be aware of in some educational programs that are offered
128 by accrediting agencies such as the Constructor Certification Program and the American
129 Council for Construction Education in the U.S., and the Higher Education Advisory Panel
130 (HEAP) in China. For instance, the Constructor Certification Program stipulates that a
131 certificated professional constructor should have much knowledge to handle project scope
132 development, employment practices, working relationships, construction resource
133 management, construction cost control, project closeout, construction risk management and
134 ethics. Driven by the substantially high specialization (Dubois and Gadde 2000), CMCs'
135 knowledge has become multi-dimensional (Love et al. 2002), and the knowledge structure
136 must keep transforming.

137

138 **RESEARCH METHODS**

139

140 Knowledge can be thought of as comprising two dimensions - explicit knowledge and tacit
141 knowledge (Smith 2001; Wyatt 2001). This study was primarily focused on explicit
142 knowledge, as it can be easily codified and communicated in symbolic form or natural
143 language (Nonaka 1991; Alavi and Leidner 2001). The identification of explicit CMCs'

144 knowledge can form a bedrock for future examination on tacit knowledge.

145

146 *Identification of CMCs' knowledge areas*

147

148 Identifying the knowledge areas needed in practice is a daunting task to undertake as
149 knowledge is in nature invisible, intangible and usually experience-based (Bontis et al. 1999;
150 Kivrak et al. 2008). The construction management programs in a sample of Chinese
151 universities were first examined thoroughly to identify the curricula involved. In fact, the
152 curricula are usually recommended by the HEAP for Construction Management (HEAP-CM),
153 which is under the leadership of the Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development
154 (MHURD), to those universities in China that offer construction management programs for
155 bachelors' degree. HEAP-CM members are nationally renowned professionals and scholars,
156 and they are officially appointed. The curricula recommended and the underlying knowledge
157 areas are found comprehensive and up-to-date, as the HEAP-CM revises the curricula to
158 match the industry's changes on a regular basis. Each unit of the curricula is designed to
159 cover a specific knowledge area although some overlap may happen between different units.
160 This step of examination resulted in the identification of 22 main knowledge areas.
161 Interviews with both the HEAP-CM chairperson and the secretariat were then conducted in
162 December 2012 to validate the preliminary findings. The 22 knowledge areas were finally
163 confirmed as the main curricula of construction management programs in China.

164

165 The major knowledge areas underlying the curricula were tentatively grouped into four
166 categories - technology, economy, management and law as shown in Table 1.

167

168 << Here is Table 1 >>

169

170 The knowledge areas listed in Table 1 have multi-disciplinary attributes in common with the
171 knowledge areas developed by both PMI and APM. However, it is noted that the identified
172 knowledge areas are China-specific, while both PMI and APM knowledge areas provide a
173 generic set of guides to manage projects in the world.

174

175 *Questionnaire survey*

176

177 A questionnaire survey was subsequently conducted nationwide to collect the opinions of
178 experienced CMCs on the proposed knowledge areas in terms of importance in theory and for
179 potential improvement in practice. In the main body of the questionnaire, respondents were
180 invited to mark the importance level and the need-for-improvement level of the 22 knowledge
181 areas by using a five-point Likert scale from 1 (extremely unimportant/unnecessary) to 5
182 (extremely important/necessary). The questionnaire was distributed by means of snowball
183 sampling. A small pool of initial respondents was initially invited to recommend alternative
184 CMCs who were known through their social networking. The recommended CMCs were all
185 requested to have rich knowledge and experience of CMSs and work in different regions. 500
186 CMCs were invited to participate in the survey, and 134 returned their questionnaires, giving
187 a response rate of 26.80%. Of the returned questionnaires, 115 were appreciated valid and
188 were selected for data analysis. As shown in Tables 2 and 3, the participated respondents
189 distributed in a large majority of provinces in China with more than 60 percent having
190 working experience of CMSs for over four years.

191

192 <<Here are Tables 2 & 3>>

193

194 In order to explore whether the important knowledge area needs improvement in practice, the
195 differences between the ‘importance’ dimension and the ‘need for improvement’ dimension
196 were examined by conducting Hotelling's T-square Test, which is a widely used
197 multi-variable test method and applicable to average vectors of comparison between two
198 groups (Kendall 1980). Furthermore, to identify the difference between each category and the
199 difference between knowledge areas, one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) was adopted
200 given that ANOVA is a useful statistical technique to determine whether or not significant
201 difference exists among the means of groups of observations (Cirincione 1999).

202

203 **DATA ANALYSIS**

204

205 *Rankings of Knowledge Areas*

206

207 According to Table 4, all the mean values of the knowledge areas are larger than 3.0,
208 suggesting that the identified knowledge areas are both important and in need of
209 improvement in practice. Engineering Cost Planning and Control (M₆) ranks first in both
210 importance and need-for-improvement with a mean value 4.270 and 4.261 respectively. This
211 is followed by Civil Engineering Construction (T₈), Engineering Contract and Law (L₃) and
212 Construction Project Management (M₂). Notably, the two dimensions - importance and
213 need-for-improvement have virtually identical rankings. Also of significance is that the
214 economic knowledge areas are generally lower than the others shown in Table 1. For instance,
215 Engineering Economics (E₂), ranked first in the economic knowledge areas, was found in the
216 middle of all 22 knowledge areas, while Statistics (E₄) and Banking and Insurance (E₃) stay at
217 the bottom in both the two dimensions.

218

219 << Here is Table 4 >>

220

221 Mean value and rank of each category are shown in Table 5. As Table 5 indicates, the two
222 dimensions of ‘importance’ and ‘need-for-improvement’ have exactly same ranks.
223 Law-related knowledge is not only most important but also the one that needs to improve
224 most in practice among the four categories. Technical knowledge and managerial knowledge
225 rank at the second and third place respectively. Similar to the results shown in Table 4,
226 economy-related knowledge, the lowest among the four categories, receives less attention
227 with a mean value 3.393 and 3.483 in the two dimensions respectively.

228

229 << Here is Table 5 >>

230

231 ***Data Conversion***

232

233 The returned questionnaires were classified into 19 regional groups as indicated in Table 3.
234 As the data collected are non-continuous, a continuity test was conducted to find out whether
235 they meet statistical requirements. The mean score of each knowledge area in each regional
236 group was calculated by using the following equation.

237

$$238 \quad X_{ij} = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^n x_{ij}}{n}$$

239

240 Where $i = 1$ or 2 denotes the importance and need-for-improvement respectively, $j = 1, 2, \dots, 22$
241 denoted the knowledge areas, and n refers to the number of respondents in a region. The
242 mean scores derived in this way are continuous on the range (1, 5) and meet continuous

243 distribution requirements.

244

245 *Hotelling's T-square Test*

246

247 Before the Hotelling's T-square Test, normality and covariance homogeneity tests were
248 conducted to ensure data validation. Although the Central Limit Theorem would imply a
249 normal distribution of the means, the Kolmogorov-Smirnov (K-S) statistic is used as an
250 empirical test (Lilliefors 1967). As there are multiple tests involved, Bonferroni correction is
251 needed for each individual test at a significance level of α' :

252

253 $\alpha' = \alpha/n$

254

255 Where α denotes the significance level, n denotes test times. In this research, at the 5% level,
256 $\alpha' = \alpha/n = 0.05/22 = 0.0023$. As given in Table 6, the scores distributions for 'importance',
257 'need-for-improvement' and 'importance + need-for-improvement' are not significantly
258 different from the normal distribution, as none of the significance values is less than 0.0023.

259

260 << Here is Table 6 >>

261

262 Box's M test was used to test for homogeneity of covariance matrices. Box's M test is highly
263 sensitive. Unless $p < 0.001$ and the sample sizes are unequal, the null hypothesis can be
264 rejected (Tabachnick and Fidell, 2001). As Table 7 indicates, the null hypothesis that the
265 observed covariance matrices of the dependent variables are equal across groups can be
266 accepted.

267

268 << Here is Table 7 >>

269

270 The results of the above tests indicate that the collected data are appropriate for Hotelling's
271 T-square Test. As shown in Table 8, the significance values in each knowledge category are
272 greater than the critical 0.05, so the null hypothesis is accepted. It can be found that those
273 knowledge areas that are most important are also in greatest need of improvement in practice.

274

275 << Here is Table 8 >>

276

277 ***Testing for differences between categories***

278

279 One-way ANOVA was adopted in testing for differences between each category. The results
280 are shown in Table 9. As there are multiple tests involved, the critical value Bonferroni
281 correction was applied, $\alpha' = \alpha/m = 0.05/(4*(4-1)/2) = 0.0083$. It can be found that significant
282 differences exist between the four categories on the importance dimension ($p=0.000$). Based
283 on the results in Table 9, law-related knowledge (Table 5), has statistically significant
284 differences from both management-related and economy-related knowledge. In addition,
285 economy-related knowledge, which has significant differences from the remainder three
286 (Sig. < 0.0083, Table 9), is considered least important (Table 5). Similar to the importance
287 dimension, the knowledge needed for improvement has also significant differences between
288 categories ($p=0.011$). Law-related knowledge, which is the most need for improvement
289 (Table 5), has significant differences from economy-related knowledge (the least need for
290 improvement Table 5) (Sig. < 0.0083, Table 9).

291

292 << Here is Table 9 >>

293

294 **DISCUSSION**

295

296 Results of the data analysis described above have outlined a list of 22 knowledge areas, the
297 main results being that the perceived level of importance for each knowledge area is almost
298 identical to the level of improvement needed in practice. Both these aspects can, therefore, be
299 discussed as one. That is, in referring to the importance of a knowledge area, this also implies
300 that it is equivalently in need of improvement in practice. In addition, of equal importance are
301 the identified categories of technology, economy, management and law. Both the meanings of
302 these categories and the differences between knowledge areas per category are explained
303 further in the following sections. The differences between knowledge areas in each category
304 were analyzed using one-way ANOVA and the results are shown in Table 10.

305

306 << Here is Table 10 >>

307

308 ***Technology***

309

310 CMSs rely primarily on technology (Hwang and Ng 2013). In China, the majority of CMCs
311 have technical or engineering academic backgrounds (Liu et al. 2004). Technical knowledge
312 can determine significantly CMCs' performance, as it is the foundation of technical
313 capabilities (such as time management and quality management) which are more important to
314 clients/owners than management and financial capabilities (Ng and Chow 2004). Partial
315 support for this view, the results shown in Table 9 indicate that technology-related knowledge
316 merely has statistically significant differences from economy-related knowledge on the
317 importance dimension. Technology has become a particular issue in highly complex projects,

318 where Chinese clients/owners, especially the government, usually seek technical assistance
319 from foreign engineering consulting firms due to their superior technical strengths (Ling et al.
320 2005; Ling and Gui 2009; Zhao et al. 2011). Moreover, the leverage effects of technology for
321 competitive advantage are increasingly important in delivering projects successfully
322 (Edum-Fotwe and McCaffer 2000).

323

324 Based on the results of one-way ANOVA (Table 10), it can be found that the differences
325 between technical knowledge areas on both ‘importance’ and ‘need-for-improvement’
326 dimensions are significant. According to Bonferroni correction,
327 $\alpha' = \alpha/m = 0.05/(8*(8-1)/2) = 0.0018$. Civil Engineering Construction (T₈) is most important with
328 the highest rank in this category. Similarly, it has significant differences from Construction
329 Equipment (T₆), Civil Engineering Survey (T₃), and Urban Planning (T₇) on both the two
330 dimensions. One of the primary reasons for the highest rank of Civil Engineering
331 Construction (T₈) is that (as most of CMSs are provided in the construction stage)
332 construction technology, process management and organization management are the
333 cornerstone of construction management in practice. In addition, Urban Planning (T₇), which
334 was ranked lowest in the technology category, is regarded least important as CMSs are
335 mainly carried out in the mid to late stages of the construction life cycle (Lindahl and Ryd
336 2007).

337

338 ***Economy***

339

340 Economic knowledge supports CMCs to assist clients/owners in making investment decisions.
341 This is particularly the case with the accelerating reform of the investment system in China.
342 By far, the concept of “Who invests, who decides, who takes risks” requires clients to make

343 decisions on investment independently and to take the corresponding risks in their own ways.

344

345 According to the results shown in Table 10, significant difference can be found between
346 economy-related knowledge areas on both ‘importance’ and ‘need-for-improvement’
347 dimensions ($p=0.000<0.05$). Based on Bonferroni correction,
348 $\alpha'=\alpha/m=0.05/(4*(4-1)/2)=0.0083$. According to the results of one-way ANOVA, Engineering
349 Economics (E_2) has significant differences from all the other three economy-related
350 knowledge areas on both the two dimensions because their significant values are less than
351 0.0083. This, combined with its ranks shown in Table 4, indicates that Engineering
352 Economics (E_2) is most important and it is equally needed for improvement. The importance
353 of Engineering Economics (E_2) is probably because it improves the efficiency of construction
354 activities through systematic economic analysis. Banking and Insurance (E_3), being ranked at
355 the bottom in Table 4, is the least important knowledge area. CMSs are relatively traditional
356 sectors where practitioners normally pay closer attention to obtaining professional knowledge,
357 while banking and insurance are emerging but comparatively new markets with high degree
358 of specialization. Insurance policies are unpopular in the Chinese construction market, with
359 the main drivers of construction insurance applications being not risk mitigation but standard
360 contracts or construction law (Liu et al. 2007). Also, project management liability insurance
361 is lacking due to China's immature professional insurance system (Zhao et al. 2011). This low
362 ranking, however, stands in contrast with Zou et al. (2007) and Ling and Gui (2009) asserting
363 that CMCs need to improve their knowledge of banking and insurance greatly for the
364 uncertain nature of construction markets.

365

366 ***Management***

367

368 Basically, CMCs shall have sufficient management knowledge to help achieve project goals
369 of cost, schedule, quality and safety. To acquire the requisite management capabilities, it is
370 very important that CMCs are equipped with both technical and non-technical management
371 knowledge (Ng and Chow 2004). However, many Chinese consulting firms are still
372 unfamiliar with advanced project management techniques and lack sufficient management
373 abilities (Ling and Gui 2009).

374

375 As indicated in Table 10, the differences between management-related knowledge on both the
376 two dimensions are significant ($p=0.000<0.05$). Based on Bonferroni correction,
377 $\alpha'=\alpha/m=0.05/(6*(6-1)/2)=0.0033$. Table 4 indicates that Engineering Cost Planning and
378 Control (M_6) and Construction Project Management (M_2) can be deemed the most important
379 management-related knowledge areas. Both of them have significant differences from
380 Management Science (M_1), Financial Management (M_3), Operational Research (M_4) and
381 Accounting (M_5) on both the two dimensions, and these two knowledge areas form the top
382 group in this category. The importance of them can be ascribed to the fact that Engineering
383 Cost Planning and Control (M_6) supports CMCs to realize clients/owners' predefined
384 investment objectives through cost and price management, and Construction Project
385 Management (M_2) mainly refers to construction site management aimed at achieving quality,
386 cost and schedule targets. Accounting (M_5), which has the lowest rank under this category, is
387 considered least important in the management-related knowledge area as accounting services
388 are normally provided by professional accountants instead of CMCs.

389

390 ***Law***

391

392 Construction law and regulations are part of the external environment for CMSs and it is

393 necessary to ensure their compliance. Increasingly complex construction projects have arouse
394 complex disputes (Harmon 2003), while unreasonable and unlawful management practices
395 exist in the Chinese construction market at the same time (Lan and Jackson 2001). CMCs
396 usually utilize law knowledge to handle disputes and other activities and protect their
397 legitimate rights and interests. However, acquiring sufficient law knowledge is not easy due
398 to the fragmentation of China's regulatory authorities, the frequent introduction of new
399 regulations and policies and ambiguity in legal content (Ling and Low 2007; Liu et al. 2007).

400

401 As Table 10 indicates, the law-related knowledge areas have significant difference on the
402 importance dimension ($p=0.000$), while the difference is no longer statistically significant on
403 the dimension of 'need for improvement' ($p=0.213$). Based on the Bonferroni correction,
404 $\alpha'=\alpha/m=0.05/(4*(4-1)/2)=0.0083$. Engineering Contract and Law (L_3), which has the
405 maximum mean value in the law category, is appreciated most important. Results in Table 10
406 suggest that Engineering Contract and Law (L_3) has significant differences from Economic
407 Law (L_1) and Administrative Regulation (L_4) on the importance dimensions. The importance
408 of Engineering Contract and Law (L_3) is triggered from the industry that interests of different
409 stakeholders in CMSs are established through contractual relationships under the legal
410 framework. This concurs with the findings of Zhang (1998) that in contrast with foreign
411 consultants, Chinese CMCs have a poor understanding and awareness of legal and contract
412 issues. In addition, Economic Law (L_1), which has obtained less attention from CMSs
413 practitioners, is considered as least important law-related knowledge. One of the primary
414 reasons is that Economic Law (L_1) is used to guide general economic activities instead of
415 targeting at CMSs, resulting in its limited applicability.

416

417 **CONCLUSIONS**

418

419 CMSs make a significant contribution to the rapid growth of China's construction sector. In
420 order to provide quality construction management services to clients/owners and maintain
421 competitive advantage effectively, CMCs have the importance of possessing a diverse,
422 dynamic and reasonable knowledge structure. In this study, a total of 22 important CMCs'
423 knowledge areas were identified and grouped into four categories, namely technology,
424 economy, management and law. Significantly, it is found that the perceived level of
425 importance for each area is almost identical to the level of improvement needed in current
426 practice in China, with knowledge of cost planning and project management, civil
427 engineering construction, and engineering contract and law being among the most highly
428 rated. Furthermore, management-related knowledge such as cost planning and project
429 management is gaining more and more importance for qualified CMCs as clients/owners tend
430 to involve them in earlier stages of projects.

431

432 The findings of this research offer a knowledge framework for CMCs to enhance their quality
433 of service in China. For foreign CMCs, especially for those who are intended to enter the
434 Chinese CMS market, there is an urgency to evaluate their current knowledge structure
435 against those items identified here. Although the important role of CMCs' knowledge in
436 CMSs has been acknowledged in the current study, the success of CMSs might depend on
437 some other potential factors, such as effective communication between CMCs, and CMCs'
438 professional ethics. Arguably, these factors might play an increasing important role in
439 construction management programs as well as in practice in future.

440

441 This research has some limitations with respect to the lack of potential knowledge areas while
442 designing the questionnaire, although extensive investigation was conducted to guarantee the

443 comprehensiveness of indicators. The identified knowledge areas in the study are primarily
444 based on the construction management curricula proposed by the Higher Education Advisory
445 Panel, whereas the Chinese construction industry is undergoing a rapid change. Thus, future
446 research is recommended to identify more comprehensive knowledge areas by taking account
447 of the strong links between education and the development of the construction industry.

448

449 **REFERENCES**

450

451 Ahadzie, D.K., Proverbs, D.G., Olomolaiye, P., 2008. Towards Developing
452 Competency-based Measures for Construction Project Managers: Should Contextual
453 Behaviours be Distinguished from Task Behaviours? *International Journal of Project*
454 *Management*, 26, 631-645.

455 Ajmal, M., Helo, P., Kekäle, T., 2010. Critical Factors for Knowledge Management in Project
456 Business. *Journal of Knowledge management*, 14, 156-168.

457 Alavi, M., Leidner, D.E., 2001. Review: Knowledge Management and Knowledge
458 Management Systems: Conceptual Foundations and Research Issues. *MIS quarterly*, 25,
459 107-136.

460 American Council for Construction Education, 2014. American Council for Construction
461 Education Document 103: Standards and Criteria for Accreditation of Postsecondary
462 Construction Education Degree Programs.
463 http://www.acce-hq.org/images/uploads/Document_103_050314.pdf.

464 Association for Project Management, 2006. *APM Body of Knowledge (5th Edition)*.

- 465 Association for Project Management, High Wycombe, United Kingdom.
- 466 Blayse, A.M., Manley, K., 2004. Key Influences on Construction Innovation. *Construction*
467 *Innovation: Information, Process, Management*, 4, 143-154.
- 468 Bontis, N., Dragonetti, N.C., Jacobsen, K., Roos, G., 1999. The Knowledge Toolbox: A
469 Review of the Tools Available to Measure and Manage Intangible Resources. *European*
470 *Management Journal*, 17, 391-402.
- 471 Ceran, T., Dorman, A.A., 1995. The Complete Project Manager. *Journal of Architectural*
472 *Engineering*, 1, 67-72.
- 473 Chan, D.W.M., Kumaraswamy, M.M., 1997. A Comparative Study of Causes of Time
474 Overruns in Hong Kong Construction Projects. *International Journal of Project Management*,
475 15, 55-63.
- 476 Cheng, M.I., Dainty, A.R., Moore, D.R., 2005. What Makes a Good Project Manager?
477 *Human Resource Management Journal*, 15, 25-37.
- 478 Chinyio, E.A., Olomolaiye, P.O., Corbett, P., 1998. An Evaluation of the Project Needs of UK
479 Building Clients. *International Journal of Project Management*, 16, 385-391.
- 480 Cirincione, C. 1999. Analysis of variance. In: Miller, G. J. and Whicker, M. L., ed. *Handbook*
481 *of Research Methods in Public Administration*. New York: Marcel Dekker, 227-247.
- 482 Cleland, D.I., 1995. Leadership And the Project-management Body of Knowledge.
483 *International Journal of Project Management*, 13, 83-88.
- 484 Dogbegah, R., Owusu-Manu, D., Omoteso, K., 2011. A Principal Component Analysis of
485 Project Management Competencies for the Ghanaian Construction Industry. *Australasian*

- 486 Journal of Construction Economics and Building, 11, 26-40.
- 487 Du Plessis, C.,2007. A Strategic Framework for Sustainable Construction in Developing
488 Countries. Construction Management and Economics, 25, 67-76.
- 489 Dubois, A., Gadde, L.E., 2000. Supply Strategy and Network Effects—Purchasing Behaviour
490 in the Construction industry. European Journal of Purchasing & Supply Management, 6,
491 207-215.
- 492 Edum-Fotwe, F., McCaffer, R., 2000. Developing Project Management Competency:
493 Perspectives from the construction industry. International Journal of Project Management, 18,
494 111-124.
- 495 El-Sabaa, S., 2001. The Skills and Career Path of an Effective Project Manager. International
496 Journal of Project Management, 19, 1-7.
- 497 Harmon, K.M., 2003. Resolution of Construction Disputes: A Review of Current
498 Methodologies. Leadership and Management in Engineering, 3, 187-201.
- 499 Hill, R.C., Bowen, P.A., 1997. Sustainable Construction: Principles and a Framework for
500 Attainment. Construction Management & Economics, 15, 223-239.
- 501 Hwang, B.G., Ng, W.J., 2013. Project Management Knowledge and Skills for Green
502 Construction: Overcoming challenges. International Journal of Project Management, 31,
503 272-284.
- 504 Jewell, C., Flanagan, R., Lu, W. 2014. The dilemma of scope and scale for construction
505 professional service firms. Construction Management and Economics, 32, 473-486.
- 506 Kendall, M.G.,1980. Multivariate analysis, Macmillan New York.

- 507 Kivrak, S., Arslan, G., Dikmen, I., Birgonul, M.T., 2008. Capturing Knowledge in
508 Construction Projects: Knowledge Platform for Contractors. *Journal of Management in*
509 *Engineering*, 24, 87-95.
- 510 Lan, P., Jackson, J., 2001. Current Characteristics of the Main Stakeholders in the Chinese
511 Construction Industry. *International Journal for Construction Marketing*, 1, 1-18.
- 512 Lilliefors, H.W., 1967. On the Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test for Normality With Mean and
513 Variance Unknown. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 62, 399-402.
- 514 Lindahl, G., Ryd, N., 2007. Clients' Goals and the Construction Project Management Process.
515 *Facilities*, 25, 147-156.
- 516 Ling, F.Y., Gui, Y., 2009. Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats: Case Study of
517 Consulting Firms in Shenzhen, China. *Journal of Construction Engineering and Management*,
518 135, 628-636.
- 519 Ling, F.Y., Low, S.P., 2007. Legal Risks Faced by Foreign Architectural, Engineering, and
520 Construction Firms in China. *Journal of Professional Issues in Engineering Education and*
521 *Practice*, 133, 238-245.
- 522 Ling, F.Y., Ibbs, C.W., Kumaraswamy, M.M., 2005. Enablers that Help Foreign
523 Architectural, Engineering, and Construction Firms Win Construction Contracts in China.
524 *Journal of Management in Engineering*, 21, 63-69.
- 525 Liu, G.W., Shen, Q.P., Li, H., Shen, L.Y., 2004. Factors Constraining the Development of
526 Professional Project Management in China's Construction Industry. *International Journal of*
527 *Project Management*, 22, 203-211.

- 528 Liu, J., Li, B., Lin, B., Nguyen, V., 2007. Key Issues and Challenges of Risk Management
529 and Insurance in China's Construction Industry: an Empirical Study. *Industrial Management
530 & Data Systems*, 107, 382-396.
- 531 Liu, X., 2012. How to Manage the Knowledge Resources in Engineering Consulting
532 Enterprise. *Construction Economy*, 1: 16-19.
- 533 Love, P.E., Holt, G.D., Li, H., 2002. Triangulation in Construction Management Research*.
534 *Engineering Construction and Architectural Management*, 9, 294-303.
- 535 Lu, S. L., Sexton, M. 2006. Innovation in small construction knowledge - intensive
536 professional service firms: a case study of an architectural practice. *Construction
537 Management and Economics*, 24, 1269-1282.
- 538 Miles, I., 2005. Knowledge Intensive Business Services: Prospects and Policies. *foresight*, 7,
539 39-63.
- 540 Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development, 2012. Construction Supervision
541 Statistical Bulletin of China.
542 http://www.mohurd.gov.cn/zcfg/jsbwj_0/jsbwjjzsc/201309/t20130902_214916.html
- 543 Muller, E., Doloreux, D., 2009. What We Should Know about Knowledge-intensive Business
544 Services. *Technology in Society*, 31, 64-72.
- 545 NACE, 2008. NACE Rev. 2 - Statistical Classification of Economic Activities in the
546 European Community. European Communities, Luxembourg.
- 547 National Bureau of Statistics of China, 2006-2013. *Chian Statistical Yearbook*. China
548 Statistics Press, Beijing.

- 549 Ng, S.T., Chow, L.K., 2004. Evaluating Engineering Consultants' General Capabilities
550 During the Pre-selection Process—a Hong Kong Study. *Engineering, Construction and*
551 *Architectural Management*, 11, 150-158.
- 552 Nitithamyong, P., Skibniewski, M.J., 2004. Web-based Construction Project Management
553 Systems: How to Make Them Successful? *Automation in Construction*, 13, 491-506.
- 554 Nitithamyong, P., Tan, Z., 2007. Determinants for Effective Performance of External Project
555 Management Consultants in Malaysia. *Engineering, Construction and Architectural*
556 *Management*, 14, 463-478.
- 557 Nonaka, I., 1991. The Knowledge-creating Company. *Harvard Business Review*, 69, 96-104.
- 558 Odusami, K., 2002. Perceptions of Construction Professionals Concerning Important Skills of
559 Effective Project Leaders. *Journal of Management in Engineering*, 18, 61-67.
- 560 Ogunlana, S., Siddiqui, Z., Yisa, S., Olomolaiye, P., 2002. Factors and Procedures Used in
561 Matching Project Managers to Construction Projects in Bangkok. *International Journal of*
562 *Project Management*, 20, 385-400.
- 563 Project Management Institute, 2013. A Guide to the Project Management Body of Knowledge
564 (PMBOK Guide)— Fifth Edition. Project Management Institute, Newtown Square,
565 Pennsylvania.
- 566 Prahalad, C.K., Hamel, G., 1990. The Core Competence of the Corporation. *Harvard*
567 *Business Review*, 68, 79-91.
- 568 Robinson, H.S., Carrillo, P.M., Anumba, C.J., Al-Ghassani, A.M., 2005. Knowledge
569 Management Practices in Large Construction Organisations. *Engineering, Construction and*

- 570 Architectural Management, 12, 431-445.
- 571 Russell, J.S., Jaselskis, E.J., Lawrence, S.P., 1997. Continuous Assessment of Project
572 Performance. Journal of Construction Engineering and Management, 123, 64-71.
- 573 Shi, L.G., Ye, K.H., Lu, W.S., Hu, X., 2014. Improving the Competence of Construction
574 Management Consultants to Underpin Sustainable Construction in China. Habitat
575 International, 41, 236-242.
- 576 Smith, E.A., 2001. The Role of Tacit and Explicit Knowledge in the Workplace. Journal of
577 Knowledge management, 5, 311-321.
- 578 Styles, C., Patterson, P. G., La, V. Q. 2005. Executive insights: exporting services to
579 Southeast Asia: lessons from Australian knowledge-based service exporters. Journal of
580 International Marketing, 13, 104-128.
- 581 Tabachnick, B.G., Fidell, L.S., 2001. Using Multivariate Statistics. Harper Collins, New
582 York.
- 583 Turner, J.R., Müller, R., 2003. On the Nature of the Project as a Temporary Organization.
584 International Journal of Project Management, 21, 1-8.
- 585 Wirth, I., Tryloff, D.E., 1995. Preliminary Comparison of Six Efforts to Document the
586 Project-management Body of Knowledge. International Journal of Project Management, 13,
587 109-118.
- 588 Woo, J.H., Clayton, M.J., Johnson, R.E., Flores, B.E. Ellis, C., 2004. Dynamic Knowledge
589 Map: Reusing Experts' Tacit Knowledge in the AEC Industry. Automation in Construction, 13,
590 203-207.

591 Wyatt, J.C., 2001. Management of Explicit and Tacit Knowledge. Journal of the Royal
592 Society of Medicine, 94, 6-9.

593 Xia, B., Chan, A.P., 2012. Measuring Complexity for Building Projects: a Delphi Study.
594 Engineering, Construction and Architectural Management, 19, 7-24.

595 Zhang, X.P., 1998. Analysis of Difference of Home and Abroad Engineering Consultant
596 Character. Project Management, 3, 18-19.

597 Zhao, Z.Y., Zuo, J., Zillante, G., 2011. Situation and Competitiveness of Foreign Project
598 Management Consultancy Enterprises in China. Journal of Management in Engineering, 27,
599 200-209.

600 Zou, P.X., Zhang, G., Wang, J., 2007. Understanding the Key Risks in Construction Projects
601 in China. International Journal of Project Management, 25, 601-614.

602

603

604

605

606

607

608

609

610

611

612

613 Table 1 Main knowledge areas in construction management curriculum

Category	Code	Knowledge areas
Technology	T ₁	Civil Engineering Drawing
	T ₂	Construction Materials
	T ₃	Civil Engineering Surveying
	T ₄	Building Architecture
	T ₅	Building Structure
	T ₆	Construction Equipment
	T ₇	Urban Planning
	T ₈	Civil Engineering Construction
Economy	E ₁	Micro- or Macro-economics
	E ₂	Engineering Economics
	E ₃	Banking and Insurance
	E ₄	Statistics
Management	M ₁	Management Science
	M ₂	Construction Project Management
	M ₃	Financial Management
	M ₄	Operational Science
	M ₅	Accounting
	M ₆	Engineering Cost Planning and Control
Law	L ₁	Economic Law
	L ₂	Construction Regulations
	L ₃	Engineering Contract and Law
	L ₄	Administrative Regulation

614

615

616 Table 2 Distribution of the respondents' positions in organization

Position in organization	Number	Percentage
Frontline employee	44	38.3%
Department manager	37	32.2%
Company executive	19	16.5%
Others	15	13.0%

617

618

619 Table 3 Distribution of the respondents' locations

Guangdong	Jiangsu	Chongqing	Sichuan	Shanghai	Beijing	Shandong
15	11	10	9	9	9	8
Zhejiang	Tianjing	Fujian	Liaoning	Shan-xi	Hubei	Hei Longjiang
7	6	6	5	3	3	3
Anhui	Shanxi	Jiangxi	Hunan	Henan		
3	2	2	2	2		

620

621

622 Table 4 Mean value and rank of each knowledge areas

Knowledge areas	Importance			Need for improvement		
	Mean	SD*	Rank	Mean	SD*	Rank
Engineering Cost Planning and Control (M ₆)	4.270	0.8818	1	4.261	0.8593	1
Civil Engineering Construction(T ₈)	4.235	0.9016	2	4.200	0.9219	3
Engineering Contract and Law(L ₃)	4.235	0.9941	3	4.235	0.9852	2
Construction Project Management(M ₂)	4.191	0.9070	4	4.183	0.9137	4
Construction Regulations(L ₂)	4.087	1.0223	5	4.096	0.9998	6
Civil Engineering Drawing(T ₁)	4.052	0.8770	6	4.139	0.8775	5
Building Structure(T ₅)	4.026	0.8631	7	4.000	0.8885	7
Building Architecture(T ₄)	3.965	0.8878	8	3.974	0.8931	8
Engineering Economics(E ₂)	3.948	0.8870	9	3.939	0.8815	9
Construction Materials(T ₂)	3.826	0.9009	10	3.835	0.8977	10
Financial Management(M ₃)	3.643	0.9929	11	3.635	0.9112	11
Construction Equipment (T ₆)	3.626	0.8214	12	3.617	0.8541	12
Administrative Regulation(L ₄)	3.617	1.0138	13	3.574	1.0179	15
Management Science(M ₁)	3.574	1.1079	14	3.530	0.9940	16
Economic Law(L ₁)	3.565	1.0271	15	3.591	1.0164	13
Civil Engineering Surveying(T ₃)	3.504	0.9117	16	3.591	0.8875	14
Micro- or Macro- economics(E ₁)	3.357	0.8705	17	3.304	0.8902	17
Urban Planning(T ₇)	3.296	0.9174	18	3.278	0.9510	18
Operational Research(M ₄)	3.278	0.9783	19	3.243	0.9328	19
Accounting(M ₅)	3.226	0.9557	20	3.200	0.9291	20
Statistics(E ₄)	3.165	1.0168	21	3.122	0.9836	21
Banking and Insurance(E ₃)	3.104	0.8622	22	3.026	0.8631	22

623 Note: SD* means standard deviation.

624

625 Table 5. Mean value and rank of each category

Category	Importance		Need for improvement	
	Mean	Rank	Mean	Rank
Law	3.876	1	3.874	1
Technology	3.816	2	3.829	2
Management	3.697	3	3.675	3
Economy	3.393	4	3.483	4

626

627

628 Table 6 Results of the K-S tests for normal distribution

Category	Curricular a	a + b		a		b	
		K-S Value	Sig.-Value	K-S Value	Sig.- Value	K-S Value	Sig.- Value
Technology	T ₁	0.728	0.664	0.498	0.965	0.688	0.783
	T ₂	0.774	0.587	0.526	0.945	0.745	0.635
	T ₃	1.002	0.268	0.912	0.376	1.005	0.265
	T ₄	1.240	0.092	1.146	0.145	0.757	0.616
	T ₅	1.217	0.103	0.607	0.856	1.249	0.088
	T ₆	1.173	0.127	0.739	0.645	1.054	0.217
	T ₇	0.898	0.396	0.719	0.680	0.744	0.638
	T ₈	0.710	0.695	0.519	0.950	1.058	0.213
Economy	E ₁	0.811	0.526	0.758	0.614	0.828	0.499
	E ₂	1.181	0.123	0.812	0.525	1.063	0.208
	E ₃	0.942	0.337	0.768	0.597	0.871	0.434
	E ₄	0.528	0.943	0.538	0.934	0.675	0.753
Manageme nt	M ₁	0.942	0.337	0.882	0.418	0.462	0.983
	M ₂	0.890	0.406	0.846	0.472	0.446	0.989
	M ₃	1.061	0.210	1.021	0.248	0.892	0.403
	M ₄	0.806	0.534	0.698	0.715	0.633	0.817
	M ₅	0.946	0.332	0.625	0.830	0.717	0.683
	M ₆	0.549	0.924	0.620	0.837	0.466	0.982
Law	L ₁	0.819	0.513	0.718	0.680	0.470	0.980
	L ₂	1.139	0.149	0.955	0.321	0.623	0.832
	L ₃	1.168	0.130	1.011	0.258	0.707	0.700
	L ₄	0.814	0.521	0.845	0.473	0.544	0.928

629 Note: a – importance; b – need for improvement

630

631 Table 7 Results of Box's M test

Category	Sig.
Technology	0.151
Economy	0.029
Management	0.354
Law	0.771

632

633

634 Table 8 Results of the Hotelling's T-square Test

Category	Pillai's Trace			Wilks' Trace			Hotelling's Trace		
	Value	F	Sig.	Value	F	Sig.	Value	F	Sig.
Technology	0.107	0.436	0.890	0.893	0.436	0.890	0.120	0.436	0.890
Economy	0.115	1.076	0.384	0.885	1.076	0.384	0.130	1.076	0.384
Management	0.037	0.201	0.974	0.963	0.201	0.974	0.039	0.201	0.974
Law	0.025	0.213	0.929	0.975	0.213	0.929	0.026	0.213	0.929

635

636

637 Table 9 Results of one-way ANOVA

Importance		Need for improvement	
p=0.000		p=0.011	
Groups	Sig.	Groups	Sig.
Technology, Economy	0.000	Technology, Economy	0.122
Technology, Management	0.132	Technology, Management	0.697
Technology, Law	0.095	Technology, Law	0.027
Economy, Management	0.002	Economy, Management	0.253
Economy, Law	0.000	Economy, Law	0.001
Management, Law	0.005	Management, Law	0.015

638

639

640 Table 10 Results of one-way ANOVA in each category

Importance			Need for improvement		
Category	Groups	Sig.	Category	Groups	Sig.
Technology (p=0.000)	T ₁ , T ₂	0.033	Technology (p=0.000)	T ₁ , T ₂	1.000
	T ₁ , T ₃	0.000		T ₁ , T ₃	0.014
	T ₁ , T ₄	0.249		T ₁ , T ₄	0.993
	T ₁ , T ₅	0.950		T ₁ , T ₅	1.000
	T ₁ , T ₆	0.001		T ₁ , T ₆	0.029
	T ₁ , T ₇	0.000		T ₁ , T ₇	0.000
	T ₁ , T ₈	0.360		T ₁ , T ₈	1.000
	T ₂ , T ₃	0.069		T ₂ , T ₃	0.322
	T ₂ , T ₄	0.324		T ₂ , T ₄	1.000
	T ₂ , T ₅	0.029		T ₂ , T ₅	1.000
	T ₂ , T ₆	0.248		T ₂ , T ₆	0.372
	T ₂ , T ₇	0.007		T ₂ , T ₇	0.002
	T ₂ , T ₈	0.003		T ₂ , T ₈	0.674
	T ₃ , T ₄	0.005		T ₃ , T ₄	0.644
	T ₃ , T ₅	0.000		T ₃ , T ₅	0.002
	T ₃ , T ₆	0.504		T ₃ , T ₆	1.000
	T ₃ , T ₇	0.372		T ₃ , T ₇	0.438
	T ₃ , T ₈	0.000		T ₃ , T ₈	0.000
	T ₄ , T ₅	0.224		T ₄ , T ₅	0.999
	T ₄ , T ₆	0.033		T ₄ , T ₆	0.658
	T ₄ , T ₇	0.000		T ₄ , T ₇	0.007
	T ₄ , T ₈	0.040		T ₄ , T ₈	0.346
	T ₅ , T ₆	0.001		T ₅ , T ₆	0.018
	T ₅ , T ₇	0.000		T ₅ , T ₇	0.000
	T ₅ , T ₈	0.394		T ₅ , T ₈	0.840
	T ₆ , T ₇	0.120		T ₆ , T ₇	0.900
	T ₆ , T ₈	0.000		T ₆ , T ₈	0.001
	T ₇ , T ₈	0.000		T ₇ , T ₈	0.000
Economy (p=0.000)	E ₁ , E ₂	0.002	Economy (p=0.000)	E ₁ , E ₂	0.005
	E ₁ , E ₃	0.102		E ₁ , E ₃	0.018
	E ₁ , E ₄	0.141		E ₁ , E ₄	0.511
	E ₂ , E ₃	0.000		E ₂ , E ₃	0.000
	E ₂ , E ₄	0.000		E ₂ , E ₄	0.001
E ₃ , E ₄	0.868	E ₃ , E ₄	0.958		
Management (p=0.000)	M ₁ , M ₂	0.000	Management (p=0.000)	M ₁ , M ₂	0.000
	M ₁ , M ₃	0.380		M ₁ , M ₃	0.271
	M ₁ , M ₄	0.263		M ₁ , M ₄	0.220
	M ₁ , M ₅	0.034		M ₁ , M ₅	0.100

	M ₁ , M ₆	0.000		M ₁ , M ₆	0.000
	M ₂ , M ₃	0.002		M ₂ , M ₃	0.000
	M ₂ , M ₄	0.000		M ₂ , M ₄	0.000
	M ₂ , M ₅	0.000		M ₂ , M ₅	0.000
	M ₂ , M ₆	0.520		M ₂ , M ₆	0.419
	M ₃ , M ₄	0.047		M ₃ , M ₄	0.021
	M ₃ , M ₅	0.003		M ₃ , M ₅	0.007
	M ₃ , M ₆	0.000		M ₃ , M ₆	0.000
	M ₄ , M ₅	0.308		M ₄ , M ₅	0.672
	M ₄ , M ₆	0.000		M ₄ , M ₆	0.000
	M ₅ , M ₆	0.000		M ₅ , M ₆	0.000
	L ₁ , L ₂	0.000		L ₁ , L ₂	0.008
	L ₁ , L ₃	0.000		L ₁ , L ₃	0.765
Law	L ₁ , L ₄	0.704	Law	L ₁ , L ₄	1.000
(p=0.000)	L ₂ , L ₃	0.666	(p=0.213)	L ₂ , L ₃	0.883
	L ₂ , L ₄	0.001		L ₂ , L ₄	0.002
	L ₃ , L ₄	0.000		L ₃ , L ₄	0.750

641

642